To Accreditation Council of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care 06.06.2022

# REPORT OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF THE EVALUATION OF <u>THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME</u> "NEPHROLOGY (ADULTS, CHILDREN'S)" (PRIMARY ACCREDITATION) OF NJSC "SEMEY MEDICAL UNIVERSITY" FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS FOR POSTGRADUATE PROGRAMMES (SPECIALTY OF RESIDENCY) IN MEDICAL EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTIONS

period of external expert evaluation: 23-25.05.2022

Semey, 2022

TABLE (	OF CON	NTENTS
---------	--------	--------

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	4
2.	General part of the final report	5
2.1.	Presentation of the residency educational programme in the specialty	5
	"Nephrology (adult, children's)" of NJSC "Semey Medical University"	
2.2.	Information on previous accreditation	6
2.3.	Conclusion based on the results of reviewing the self-assessment report of the	
	educational programme "Nephrology (adult, children's)" for compliance with the	6
	Standards of accreditation of postgraduate education programmes (residency	
	specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions	
3.	Description of the external expert evaluation and conclusion	8
4.	Results of the survey of teachers and residents	14
5.	Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an	14
	external evaluation of the educational programme in the specialty "Nephrology	
	(adult, children's)"	
6.	Recommendations for improving the educational programme "Nephrology	42
	(adult, children's)"	
7.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	42
	Attachment 1. Quality profile and criteria of external evaluation and educational	44
	programme of the residency in the specialty "Nephrology (adult, children's)"	
	Attachment 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert evaluation	45
	Attachment 3. Organization Visit programme	50%

# List of symbols and abbreviations

Abbreviation	Interpretation	
AMP	administrative and managerial staff	
BD	Basic disciplines	
BHE	basic health education	
PRS	point-rating system	
Blueprint	lesson topic technical specification	
EH	Emergency Hospital	
EKR	East Kazakhstan region	
University	Higher education institution	
EEC	External expert commission	
SAC	State Attestation Commission	
CSVD	City skin and venereological dispensary	
SCES	State Compulsory Educational Standard	
JD	job description	
DOPS	direct observe of procedural skills	
ESUVO	unified system of accounting for higher education	
ECAQA	Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher	
	Education and Health Care	
LIS	library information system	
FSA	final state attestation	
FSE	final state examination	
IL	letter of Instruction	
STIs	Sexually transmitted infections	
Irbis	library information system	
IMS	integrated management system	
IEPI	Individual Educational Plan	
CIS	Control and measuring system	
CQAES	Committee for Quality Assurance in Education and Science	
KMIS	Kazakhstan Medical Information System	
Committe	integrated discipline	
СЕР	Educational Programmes Committee	
HCF	health care facility	
LMS	learning management system KEYPS	
MoH RoK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan	
LEB	Local Executive Bodies	
MES RoK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan	
MEP	Modular educational programme	
MTE	material and technical equipment	
mini-CEX	mini-Clinical Exam	
MSF	360 Degree Rating	
NJSC "SMU"	Non-profit joint-stock company "Semey Medical University"	
RW	Research work	
NLA	normative legal act	
GED	General educational disciplines	
DQCME	Medical Education Quality Control Department	
GM	"General Medicine"	
EP	Educational programme	
RO	registrar's Office	

assessment of tolerance rating	
objective structured practical exam	
Objective Structured Clinical Exam	
project-oriented training	
Profiling Disciplines	
Teaching staff	
project-oriented training	
Profiling Disciplines	
Working Educational plan	
Republican Educational and Methodological Section	
Case-based- CBL learning	
Case-based-discussion	
c-content programme evaluation model; I - costs, investments; P - process	
and P – product	
Quality Management System	
Student Scientific Society	
Structural unit	
student self-government	
standardized patients	
international standard for e-learning courses	
Typical educational plan	
Team-based-learning	
Turkish National Standard of Medical Education	
Scientific Council	
Health Care Department	
Institution "Beginning Center"	
School of Postgraduate Education	

# 1. Composition of the external expert commission

In accordance with the ECAQA Order No. 17 dated 05.05.2022, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) was formed to conduct the educational programme of the specialty "Nephrology (adult, children's)" of NJSC "SMU" in the period of 23-25.05.2022, according to an external assessment, as follows:

or der	Status as part of EEC	Full name	Academic degree, academic title, position, place of work/place of study, course, specialty
<b>№</b> 1	chairperson	Zhanalina	doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the
	1	Bakhyt Sekerbekovna	Department of Surgical and Pediatric Dentistry of NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov"
2	Foreign Expert	Ripp Evgeny Germanovich	candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the Accreditation Simulation Center of the Institute of Medical Education FSBI "National Medical Research Center named after V.A. Almazov" of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation, Member of the Board of the Russian Society for Simulation Education in Medicine (RSSTM), Member of the Programme Committee of RSSTM, Instructor of the European Council on Resuscitation (ERC)
3	Academic Expert	Dzhandaev Serik Zhakenovich	doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Otorhinolaryngology, NJSC "Medical University of Astana", Academician of the "International Academy of Head and Neck Surgery"
4	Academic Expert	Urazova Saltanat Nurgozhayevna	doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Family Medicine No.3 of "Medical University of Astana" NJSC
5	Academic Expert	Zhumalina Akmaral Kanashevna	doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Children's Diseases with Neonatology of the NJSC "West Kazakhstan State Medical University named after Marat Ospanov"
6	Academic Expert	Turgunov Yermek Meiramovich	doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Surgical Diseases of the NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda", President of the OS "Surgical Association of Karaganda Region", member of the International Surgery Society, member of the "Association of Independent Experts of Astana" and "Union of Independent Experts of KSMU"
7	Academic Expert	Ligai Zoya Nikolaevna	doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of General Medical Practice with the course of the AEMC of the NEI "Kazakh-Russian Medical University"
8	Academic Expert	Chingaeva Gulnar Nurtasovna,	doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Clinical Disciplines of the Higher School of Medicine of NJSC "Kazakh National University named after Al-Farabi", Member of the Association of Nephrologists of Kazakhstan, Russian Dialysis Society, International Pediatric Nephrology

			Association, ISN (International Society of Nephrologists), ERA-EDTA (European Renal Association – Dialysis and Transplantation)
9	Academic Expert	Bozhbanbayeva Nishangul Seitbekovna	doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Pediatric Diseases with the course of Neonatology of NJSC "Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University"
10	Academic Expert	Ulzhan Tursunkulovna Beisebaeva	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Oncology, NJSC "Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University"
11	Academic Expert	Doshakanova Assel Baidauletovna	candidate of Medical Sciences, Senior Lecturer of the Postgraduate Department of the Kazakh Order "Badge of Honor" Research Institute of Eye Diseases LLP
12	Expert – employer representative	Tuleutaeva Gulnara Esenzhanovna	Organizing physician - social hygienist of the highest category, deputy chief physician of the PSE on the REM "Polyclinic No.1", Semey, EKR HCD
13	Resident Representative	Amina Timurovna Izmaeva	Resident of the second year of study in the specialty "Ophthalmology" of NJSC "Medical University of Astana"

The observer for ECAQA is Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna, Head of Accreditation and Monitoring Department.

The work of the ECAQA was carried out in accordance with the Regulation of EEC (Order of the Director General of ECAQA No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The EEC report contains an assessment of the educational programme "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate education programmes (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the EEC on further improvement of approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above–mentioned educational programme and recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

#### 2. General part of the final report

2.1. Presentation of the residency educational programme in the specialty "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)" of NJSC "Semey Medical University"

Organization name, legal form of ownership, BIN	Non-profit joint-stock company "Semey Medical University" 190240004938
Management body	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
Full name of the chief executive officer	Dyusupov Altai Akhmetkalievich
Created in	1953
Location and contact details	Region/region: East Kazakhstan region
	Postal code: 071400
	City: Semey
	Street: Abay Kunanbayev, 103
	Tel.: +7(7222)52-22-51
	Fax: +7(7222)56-97-55
	E-mail: <u>smu@nao-SMU.kz</u>
	University website: http:

	www.semeymedicaluniversity.kz
State license for educational activities in	June 20, 2019
the residency (date, number)	No. KZ50LAA00016373
Information on branches, subsidiaries (if	NJSC SMU University Hospital, Semey
any)	Institution and branch "Kidney Center", Semey;
Veen of implementation of the second its d	2022-2023
Year of implementation of the accredited	2022-2023
educational programme (EP)	
Duration of training	2 years

The implementation of the educational programme "**7R01112 Nephrology** (adult, children's)" in NJSC "Semey Medical University" is planned from September 2022, taking into account the analysis of the needs of the regions, an increase in the number of nephrological patients.

The faculty is represented by highly qualified employees: 8 faculty members, including Doctor of Medical Sciences 1, PhD 1, Candidates of Medical Sciences -5, the degree of the department is 87.5%. With the highest or first qualification category 62.5% (5).

The mission of NJSC Semey Medical University: "Training of outstanding doctors, scientists and leaders in the field of health care to provide high-quality medical care."

The mission of the EP in the specialty "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)": "To improve the training of competent, qualified, competitive specialists who meet the modern requirements of professional competence, based on the principles of the trinity of education, science and practice, able to independently fully supervise patients with kidney diseases in adults and children in hospital and outpatient clinics.", was developed in accordance with the mission of the Semey Medical University.

The acquired knowledge, skills and abilities based on the principle of a patient-centered approach will allow graduates of the residency to work professionally, both independently and as part of a multidisciplinary team in the conditions of primary health care, inpatient nephrology and dialysis.

The programme of study in the specialty "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)" includes the study of the main current problems of nephrology, issues of differential diagnosis, diagnosis and modern methods of treatment according to clinical protocols under the guidance of an academic mentor. The educational programme also includes clinical training of the resident under the guidance of a clinical mentor (teacher) and independent work of the resident. Based on the principle of the trinity of education, science and clinics, nephrologists will be able to plan, conduct scientific research with further publication of the results, and transfer their experience to the medical community. All teachers in the specialty of the residency "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)" regularly improve their competencies, studying at advanced training cycles.

(https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1DlsgkwTGdF9O\_UiCAgqlE-lHL6YQThrM?usp=sharing). Responsibilities duties of employees reflected descriptions and are in job (https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/17XOGOdS7iNCDxtaOaW3xvUHLjZy\_vjUG?usp=sharing). The department employees have certificates and professional development certificates in such competencies as effective teaching а medical university, communication skills at (https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1qKvurkBdm6eFPZdOT8zetMTEZ0hqvKgU?usp=sharing). All teachers are certified the highest category Nephrology. in in (https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1S4TCsfPmz2OiVcp13OV7 M74HLOh1k-I?usp=sharing).

#### 2.2. Information on previous accreditation

Primary accreditation in the specialty Nephrology (adult, children's) is carried out for the first time.

2.3. Conclusion on the results of the review of the report on the self-assessment of the educational programme of the residency specialty Nephrology (adult, children's) of SMU for

# compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate programmes (residency specialty) of medical organizations of education and conclusions

The self-assessment report of the educational programme "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)" (hereinafter – the report) is presented on the pages of the main text, appendices on 84 pages, copies or electronic versions of 168 documents located at https://drive.google.com/drive/u/1/folders/1b\_GduaGvcZjwMkFqbcnoIH29AIGpNcbo

The report is characterized by the completeness of responses to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for the self-assessment of the educational programme provided to the organization of education by the accreditation center - ECAQA, as well as the internal unity of information. The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by the Head of the Management Board - Rector of NJSC "Medical University Semey" Dyusupov A.A., which confirms the reliability of quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 8 members of the internal self-assessment commission, indicating the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the self-assessment of the educational programme – Zhunusova Aigul Bitimbaeva, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Director of the Department of Academic Work.

The self-assessment of the educational programme "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)" was carried out on the basis of the order of the head No. 41 dated February 9, 2022 "On approval of the composition of the Working Group for self-assessment and preparation for accreditation of educational programmes of the residency for compliance with the standards of specialized accreditation of educational programmes of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance of Education and Health Care (ECAQA)".

The report was reviewed by the accreditation expert Gulnar Chingaeva and the review noted strengths and areas for improvement, as well as recommendations for additions and changes. Thus, in the process of feedback from the representative of the educational organization, experts received answers to the questions that arose and the self-assessment report was amended accordingly and additions were made to the recommendations of the reviewers.

All the standards provide real practice of the university for the training of residents in the specialty "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)", taking into account the beginning of admission of students in 2022-2023, reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the tasks of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment report is sufficiently complete and updated in terms of the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, learning outcomes, results of knowledge and skills assessment, material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, plans for development and improvement.

The report is submitted to ECAQA in a completed form, with correction of the data on the above recommendations, written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criterion of standards, tables and contain references in the text and have end-to-end numbering.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for moving to the next stage of the accreditation procedure, the external assessment. The experts plan to validate the report data, compare the information from the report with the information that will be obtained during the visit to the educational institution, i.e. verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

#### **3.** External expert evaluation assessment

External expert work in the framework of the evaluation of the educational programme "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the External Evaluation of Educational Organizations and Educational Programmes of ECAQA (approved by the order of the Director General of the "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in

Higher Education and Health Care" No.5 dated February 17, 2017) and in accordance with the programme approved by order No. 17 dated May 5, 2022 by the Director General of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the Chairperson of the Board - Rector of NJSC "SMU" Dyusupov A.A.

The external evaluation is aimed at validating the data of the self-assessment report and verifying the indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of accreditation standards.

The sequence of the visit within 3 days is presented in detail in the Visit Programme (hereinafter referred to as the Programme), which is contained in the documentation of the accreditation center and in Attachment 3 to this report. The programme is evidence of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of an external expert evaluation.

To obtain objective information, the EEC members used the following methods and their results:

- interview with management and administrative staff 17 people in total;
- interviews with residents only 19 people,
- study of the website https://semeymedicaluniversity.kz/
- interviewing 20 employees, 18 teachers;
- observation of the training of residents: attendance at 2 practical classes on the topic: "Secondary hypertension", teacher Kapakova M.A., group 1, residents of 1 year of study in the specialty "Therapy"; topic "Emergency care in the presentation of the placenta and premature detachment of the normally located placenta", teacher Baybusinova Zh.T., group 202, residents in the specialty "Family medicine".
- review of resources in the context of the implementation of accreditation standards: 3 practice/clinical engagement bases were visited, including the Emergency Hospital; "Jamilya" Institution; "Kidney Center" Institution, where training is conducted on 6 educational programmes with the participation of 8 full-time teachers/ part-time employees;
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 165 units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the units (the list of studied documents is in Attachment 2).

The staff of the accredited organization ensures the presence of all persons indicated in the visiting programme and according to the lists of interviews and interviews (Table 1).

N⁰	Full name	Job Title
1	Altai Akhmetkalievich Dyusupov	Chairperson of the Management Board - Rector
2	Tanatarova Gulnaz Nursoltanovna	Acting Deputy Chairperson of the Management Board for Academic and Educational Work
3	Omarov Nazarbek Bakhytbekovich	Deputy Chairperson of the Board for Science and Strategic Development
4	Turarova Elmira Merkhatovna	Head of Graduate and MF Employment (Residency)
5	Manatova Almira Manatkyzy	Dean of the School of Postgraduate Education (residency)
6	Kusainova Gulnara Zhomartovna	Head of Training Department
7	Bekbolatova Mariya Adletkyzy	Deputy Dean of SPE
8	Dzhobalayeva Bagym Sasanovna	residency methodologist
9	Krykpayeva Saltanat Sayatovna	Head of Research Institute
10	Dzhametdinova Ulzhan Slamovna	Head of the Department of Epidemiology and Biostatistics
11	Baybusinova Assel Zhanartasovna	Head of the Department of Epidemiology and Biostatistics
12	Yerkezhan Sayatovna Tursinkanbetova	Deputy Chairperson of the Management Board for Organizational and Economic Work
15	Gulnara Tursyngazyevna Nurgaliyeva	Head of Clinic Department
16	Malchenko Victoria Valerievna	Specialist of the Clinic Department

Table 1 - Information on the n	umber and category	of participants in	meetings, interviews,
interviews with EEC members			

17	Masabaeva Meruert Ravilievna	Chief Researcher, JESL	
17	Kadirsizova Gulzhan Sayatovna	Head of the Library	
10	Co-founder Darkhan Sakenovic	digital and PR Technician Engineer	
20	Tlebaldin Nurlan Berikovich,	Head of Digital and PR Technologies Department	
21	Asylbekova Aigerim Mukhametbekovna	Psychologist	
22	Rakhimzhanova Bayan Kuraltaevna	Head of Registrar's Office	
23	Tattybaeva Azhar Nurlykanovna	Head of SSC&O	
24	Kamalieva Anara Zakenovna Kozhakhmetova Dana Kenzhebaevna Akhmetzhanova Natalia Vladimirovna	Department of Quality Control of Medical Education	
25	Karsakova Ainur Tasbolatovna	head of the Department of Strategic Development and International cooperation	
26	Zhanar Dzhakubekova	specialist of the Department of Strategic and International Cooperation	
		CEP Members	
1	Zhanaspaev M.A.	chairperson of the CEP residency	
2	A.K. Akhmetova	head of the Department of Nephrology and Cosmetology	
3	Semenova Yu.M.	head of the Department of Neurology, Ophthalmology and Otorhinolaryngology	
4	G.A. Berekenova	head of the Department of Maxillofacial and Plastic Surgery	
5	F.F. Yagofarov	associate Professor of the Department of Infectious Diseases and Immunology of NJSC "SMU"	
6	Adilgozhina S.M.	assistant of the Department of Family Medicine	
7	Alibekova B.A.	assistant of the Department of Perinatology	
8	Kapakova M.A.	Assistant of the Department of Hospital Therapy	
9	Shakhanova A.T.	assistant of the Department of Faculty Therapy	
10	Toktarova Zh.Zh.	Assistant of the Department of Hospital Therapy	
11	Kazymov E.M.	assistant of the Department of Cardiovascular and Thoracic Surgery	
		Employers	
1	Raushan Kusainovna Kikimbayeva	deputy Director for the Medical Part of NJSC "SMU" UH, Semey	
2	Oroltaeva V.D.	head of the Department of Nephrology, "Kidney Center" Institution, Semey.	
3		Deputy Chief Physician of EH	
4	Duman Medeuov	nephrologist of the highest category. Director of the "Kidney Center" Institution in Semey.	
5	Azimbaeva Indira Muslimkhanovna	Chief Freelance Specialist for nephrology and dialysis of EKR, Regional Director "B.B.NURA" LLP for East Kazakhstan region	
6	Sandybaeva Mensulu Yexanovna	director of the SEMEYOFTUM Ophthalmology Clinic	
7	Buleukhanova Roza Tusupzhanovna	candidate of Medical Sciences, Director of the "Zhan-Er" MC	
8	Bekbayev Marat Kozhakhmetovich	chief Physician of the State Enterprise on the Right of Economic Management "Polyclinic No.4 of Semey" of the DHC of East Kazakhstan region	
9	Almenova Nailia Sapanovna	Chief physician of the polyclinic No. 3 in Semey	
10	Zhanat Tursyngaliyevna   Moldagaliyeva Nordagaliyeva	Head of Polyclinic No.7 in Semey	
11	Baltakaeva Almagul Kabiyevna	chief Doctor of the Central Hospital of the Abai District, village of Guard	
12	Dyusekenova Gulzhazira Kinayatovna,	Head of the Neonatal Service of the Human Rights Center in Semey.	

13	Abeshova Asiya Mukhametkarimovna,	head of the Department of Neonatal Pathology of PC, Semey
14	Galiya Aytchanovna Alibekova.	Deputy Director for Medical Work, EMH
15	Popov Sergey Alexandrovich	Chief Physician, "City Hospital No. 4" PSE on the REM, Ust-
		Kamenogorsk
16	Abdieva Zagripa Tokenovna	freelance Chief Pulmonologist of DHC of East Kazakhstan
		Region
17	Azimbaeva Indira Muslimkhanovna	director of MC Hippocrates, Semey
18	Duman Medeuov	Director of the Renal Center in Semey
19	Nail Sergalievich Smailov	Head of the Neurosurgical Department of UH NJSC "SMU"
	_	

Thus, when implementing the activities of the programme, namely, according to the results of the interview with the first head of the organization, the Chairperson of the Board, the Acting Deputy Chairperson of the Board for Academic and Educational Work, the Deputy Chairperson of the Board for Science and Strategic Development, the Deputy Chairperson of the Board for Organizational and Economic Work, the Head of the Department of Employment of Graduates and MF, the Dean of the School of Postgraduate Education, the Head of the Training Department, the Head of the Research Institute, the Head of the Department of Personnel Management, the employees of the units and the Head of the Department of Employment of Graduates and the Medical Foundation, the Head of the Department of the Clinic, the employees of the JESL, members of the advisory bodies: the CEP of the Residency, in interviews with residents and teachers, compliance with the criteria of Standard 1 was established. All participants in the educational process know the mission of the organization, took part in the formation of proposals for the formulation of the mission, while the mission was brought to the attention of potential residents through the website, social networks, information letters to medical organizations. The strategic plan of the organization for the period 2020-2024 was reviewed, including such areas as the promotion of a research university; modernization and internationalization of the educational programme in accordance with global and regional trends in the training of medical personnel; ensuring financial stability; creating a comfortable environment for the development of students and university employees, which confirms the fulfillment of the accreditation standard and demonstrates the goals, objectives and prospects of the organization, which confirms the fulfillment of the accreditation standard and demonstrates the goals, objectives and prospects of the organization. From interviews with residents, it was established that before the beginning of classes, teachers inform about the mission, work plans of the organization of education, tell where to get the necessary information about the educational programme, teachers, training bases. When analyzing the educational programme Nephrology (adult, children's), it was found that it is necessary to train residents of nephrologists on the basis of other universities or research institutes in certain disciplines (for example, "Transplantology and Immunology", "Clinical Nephro Morphology"), including within the framework of academic mobility.

This indicates compliance with **Standard 2** in terms of adapting training to the needs of residents.

The organization's documents contain work programmes, EMCD, which define the goal, take into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, independent work. Compliance with the SCES and standard requirements has been established. Attending the practical lesson on "Secondary Hypertension", in the amount of 1 academic hour, the experts received convincing data that the training is carried out according to the plan, before the beginning of the lesson, residents respond to tests, receive feedback from the teacher, have the opportunity to improve the skill of diagnosing and correcting arterial hypertension, a condition that is most often encountered in the practice of a nephrologist. The organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational programme, since the experts studied the code of ethics G 041.03/04.05.01-2019 dated 01.04.2019 and during the interview the residents replied that they were informed about the content of this document.

When attending a practical lesson on "Secondary Hypertension" in the amount of 1 academic hour and talking to residents, experts saw that the organization promotes the development of practical

competencies of residents, including on simulation equipment. At the same time, residents deepen their theoretical knowledge, develop communication skills.

The analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all the achievements of science in advisory disciplines are taken into account, additions are made to the bibliography of the EMCD and syllabuses, and teachers apply them in classes.

The study of control and measuring tools (600 tests of the database of test tasks, 100 KEYPS tests, 50 clinical tasks) showed that the organization has implemented a proper evaluation policy that allows a comprehensive assessment of the educational achievements of residents. During the interview, the residents spoke about the forms of assessment, for example, assessment sheets for solving situational problems, assessment sheets for performing practical skills and that they are satisfied with everything. They also receive regular feedback from teachers. The system of appealing the results of the assessment is reflected in the "Regulation on the conduct of the appeal" G-041.03.23-2020 dated May 29, 2020, and during the period of work of the organization of education, there were no precedents for the appeal. Thus, compliance with standard 3 has been established.

During the visit to the organization, a conversation was held with the staff of the Faculty Therapy Department - Associate Professor R.I. Alibekova and Assistant A.S. Botabaeva.

The Board is satisfied that a documentation system is in place that is transparent and accessible to all teachers and staff, and includes documents such as annual operating plans, annual reports, unit regulations, teacher/resident compacts, and training and methodological documentation (work programme, work syllabuses, syllabuses, journals), evaluation tools (checklists, statements), certificates. A review of the website showed that its pages contain the necessary documents for residents "Regulations on the portfolio", "Regulations on residency" of NJSC "Semey Medical University", "Academic Policy" of NJSC "Semey Medical University", "Policy of academic honesty", etc., and there is up-to-date information that is regularly updated.

The conversation with the teachers of the department included such issues as the content of the educational programme, the formation of a catalog of elective disciplines, methods for evaluating residents, the sufficiency of clinical bases and their material and technical equipment, the amount of hours for academic mentors, requirements for clinical mentors, scientific research and publication activity of resident nephrologists, the implementation of academic mobility of teachers and residents, etc., and allowed experts to learn about approaches to attracting employees of clinical bases for teaching (3 people in total), about the strategy and tactics of recruitment of residents, the information security of the educational programme, as well as to identify problems in the management and development of human resources, since most clinical mentors do not have sufficient knowledge of teaching and evaluation methods.

Interviews with 8 teachers, including 7 full-time teachers, showed that there are both successes and problems in educational management, depending on the specific base (admission of residents to the equipment, sufficient number of thematic patients, time for maintaining medical records, independent work). Experts received answers about the programme of professional development of teachers, financing of this training, availability at teachers of certification on methods of teaching.

On the same day, experts studied materials on the admission of residents and the selection of teachers and established compliance with standard 4.

In order to verify the data of Standard 5, external experts received an opinion on personnel policy and approaches to the development of teachers' pedagogical competence, motivation to work with residents, and mentoring. Experts have found that teachers initiate research topics for residents, stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature, medical documentation.

During the visit to clinical bases, a survey of resources was carried out, their compliance with training programmes, accessibility for teachers and residents, as far as this equipment is modern and meets the needs of students and practical health care. Experts obtained evidence of compliance with Standard 6, as well as validation of the information in the self-assessment report. Recommendation: To provide for the training of residents in other universities or research institutes in certain disciplines (for

example, "Transplantology and Immunology", "Clinical Nephromorphology"), including within the framework of academic mobility.

In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report and to obtain evidence on the quality of the programmes, interviews were conducted with residents in the specialty. The experts asked questions about satisfaction with the training, enough time for patient supervision, work in DAMUMED with medical documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers, social and moral support for residents in need, participation in "Journal Clubs", accessibility of international databases of professional literature, scientific works. In general, students are satisfied with the training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this organization, since they believe that the organization of education has good resources, image and international relations, at the same time, students would like more independence in patient management, the holding of international events.

Residents showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering the questions of external experts, demonstrated their judgment on the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, opportunities to participate in research, funding, demonstrated their proficiency in English when answering the questions of a foreign expert Evgeny Germanovich Gripp. Members of the External Expert Commission (EEC) Experts studied the documents of residents (portfolio, results of assessment of residents - checklists, results of questionnaire of residents).

Interviews with 20 employers were conducted online and included such questions as: knowledge of the university's mission, participation in the development of the mission and proposals to the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in the training of residents through mentoring, providing the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and formation clinical thinking, about the problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, the percentage of employed residency graduates, etc.

The review of resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities, for example, clinical bases were visited: the University Hospital of the NJSC SMU, Semey, the Institution and branch "Kidney Center", Semey; EH, with a total bed capacity of 42, on outpatient hemodialysis of 106 patients with end-stage chronic kidney disease, and employees of the organization of education provide collegial and ethical relations with medical personnel, the management of the clinical base to achieve the final results of residents. A sufficient number of thematic patients, modern equipment and demonstrates accessibility to students are provided, and employees who simultaneously perform the roles of teachers and mentors (mentors) provide high-quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology. Before starting the relevant discipline of the educational programme, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during the training.

During the visit of the clinical bases, the experts were convinced of the availability of the necessary equipment (hemodialysis devices for patients with acute kidney injury and end-stage chronic kidney disease, plasmapheresis for the treatment of autoimmune kidney diseases), nephrological patients with various diseases. Problems: there is no possibility of nephrobiopsy and kidney transplantation. A mini-library of the Department with rare editions in the specialty Nephrology (adult, children's), both in Kazakh, Russian and English languages, has been demonstrated. During the open class, residents demonstrated discussion skills, ability to make independent decisions, sufficiency of theoretical knowledge, actively discussed clinical cases. Teachers of the department demonstrated on the KEYPS platform test tasks, the formation of formative and summative assessment of residents.

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of EEC members was held on the results of the external evaluation. The final discussion of the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme, the study of documents, the results of the interview, questionnaires was held. EEC members started designing the final EEC report. The results of the external evaluation are summarized. Experts individually completed the "Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of

the educational programme "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)" for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards". No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the educational programme were discussed and the Chairperson Zhanalina B.S. held a final open vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council for the accreditation period of 3 years.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all the necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the NJSC "SMU", the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to the members of the EEC.

At the end of the programme of the visit, the chairperson of the EEC for the management and employees of the organization of education announced recommendations on the results of an external assessment within the framework of specialized accreditation.

#### 4. Results of the survey

An observer from the ECAQA conducted an online survey on the resource in the period 23-25.05.2022 https://webanketa.com/.

#### The resident survey includes 22 questions.

In total 124 people (in total 124 residents for the current year) answered.

This university will be recommended as an organization of education -87.9% fully agree, partially -8.87%. 83.06% of respondents fully agree and 15.32% partially agree that programme managers and teaching staff are aware of their learning problems. Fully (75%) and partially (18.55%) satisfied with the conditions and equipment of the teaching rooms, classrooms of the university. According to 83.6% (fully) and 12.1% (partially) of office equipment is available for use on the basis of practice. Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes - fully agree 83.6%, partially -14.52%. Fully (86.29%) and partially (8.87%) satisfied with the library collection and resources. 91.94% of respondents have access to e-learning resources and 6.45% believe that this is a partial access.

According to 81.45%, the organization of clinical training fully satisfies them, and 16.13% partially. Satisfied completely (88.71%) and partially (10.48%) with the methods of teaching. There is sufficient time for practical training (patient supervision, etc.) – 94.35% fully agree, 5.65% partially. Satisfied with the methods of assessing my knowledge and skills –92.74% completely agree, partially 7.26\%. According to 84.71% of teachers in the classroom use active and interactive teaching methods regularly, and according to 0.81% - rarely.

According to 91.94% of respondents, teachers constantly provide feedback after completing classes, but according to 4.03% - sometimes and 1.61% - rarely. Fully satisfied that they study at the university 91.13. %, partially 8.06%, disappointed-0.81% of respondents. The university allows you to improve or acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in the chosen specialty confidently 94.35%, not sure 0.81%, cannot give an answer 3.23%, would like to believe in this 0.81%, began to doubt this -0.81%. Completely (94.5 per cent) and partially (93.55 per cent) satisfied with the organization of teaching at the NJSC "SMU".

According to 85.48% of respondents, accreditation is a necessary mechanism for improving educational programmes, but 8.06% believe that it is not necessary to conduct and 5.65% doubt the answer. The work of the EEC was assessed as positive – 92.74%, satisfactory -4.84%.

The teacher survey included 21 questionnaire questions. A total of 26 people responded. The total number of respondents was 26, including 15.38% with up to 5 years of experience, 7.69 % with up to 10 years of experience, and 76.92% with over 10 years of experience. Satisfied with the organization of the educational process completely 88.46%, partially -11.54%. The university observes ethics and subordination completely agree 88.46%, partially -11.54%. The organization of work and workplace is fully satisfied with 73.08% of respondents, partially 23.08%. In the organization there is an opportunity for career growth and competence developmenttoteachers-88,46% completely agree,

#### partially -11,54%.

In this educational institution, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of research – fully agree 80.77%, partly 19.23%. 88,46% of respondents are completely satisfied with work of personnel service, partially-7,69%. The majority of those surveyed have undergone refresher training over the past 5 years. Only 92.31% fully agree that they can be implemented as professionals, and 7.69% - partially. Unfortunately, 7.69% did not answer the question whether the university supports the teacher in participating in international and republican events, and 30.77% did not address this to the management or relevant administrative employees of the university. The majority of respondents (96.15%) completely agree, and 3.85% partially agree that students have free access to patients on the clinical bases of the university and to the resources of the practice bases. 26.92% are unaware of the implementation of social programmes to support teachers and 3.85% of respondents are doubtful about their availability. The management and administration systematically listen to the opinionofteachers-76.92%, sometimes -0% of respondents. Various methods of teaching are used in the teaching of students, but more often work - analysis of situational problems (88.46%), work in small groups (61.54%), oral surveys and analysis of the topic (50%), also problem-oriented teaching (34.62%), solution of tests (73.08%), cases are solved (88.46%), less often written performance of tasks (7.69%). Completely according to 73.08% that this questionnaire will be useful for the development of recommendations for improving the university and educational programmes of the residency, 19.23% partially agree with this.

The results of the survey in general demonstrate satisfaction with the educational process, the resources of the clinical base, the competencies of teachers, and also indicate the existence of centralized management of educational programmes.

5. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme in the specialty "Nephrology (adult, children's)"

# Standard 1: MISSION AND END OUTCOMES

# Evidence of compliance:

## **1.1 Mission statement and deliverables**

The mission of the educational programme of the residency "7R01112 Nephrology ( adult, children's)" is based on the mission of the Semey Medical University - "Training of outstanding doctors, scientists and leaders in the field of health care for the provision of high-quality medical care" (https://semeymedicaluniversity.kz/o-nas/).

The mission of the EP in the specialty "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)": "To improve the training of competent, qualified, competitive specialists who meet the modern requirements of professional competence, based on the principles of the trinity of education, science and practice, able to independently fully supervise patients with kidney diseases in adults and children in hospital and outpatient clinics.", was developed in accordance with the mission of the Semey Medical University.

As a result of meetings and interviews with teachers, employers, residents and graduates of the educational programme, it was possible to establish that, based on the principle of the trinity of education, science and clinics, neonatologist graduates, taking into account the patient-centered approach, will be able to work professionally independently in maternity institutions. The educational programme for discussion with employers, heads of departments of therapy, nephrology and hemodialysis in Semey is published on the university's website (https://drive.google.com/drive/u/1/folders/1b\_GduaGvcZjwMkFqbcnoIH29AIGpNcbo).

The study of the documentation showed that the content of the mission of the educational programme of the residence in the specialty "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)" is based on the analysis of the needs of public health and the medical care system. Within the framework of the existing need for qualified specialists in the field of Nephrology both in the East Kazakhstan region and throughout the Republic of Kazakhstan, this Mission was formulated. The content of the mission and the educational

programme in general were presented to external stakeholders, discussed at an enlarged meeting of the department (Minutes No.11a dated 14.07.2021) (https://drive.google.com/file/d/1UTB - roi\_1sZ7yDiE\_UYEqYAgqc2djM/view?usp=sharing).

The educational programme of the residency "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)" has in its structure the module "Research in medicine", which includes the disciplines "Management of scientific research" and "Biostatistics".

As part of the updating of knowledge, the development of scientific competencies, employees and residents of the department participate in master classes, webinars. Supporting the health of the population, solving social problems associated with kidney diseases, their prevention is also a priority in the training of specialists. It is planned to participate in the annual School of Nephrology, dedicated to World Kidney Day (March 8).

#### 1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy

Visiting the clinical base, attending an open class, meetings with teachers and residents allowed us to see that, following a patient-centered approach in the clinical process, while maintaining the need for assistance, each resident develops an individual level of such quality as professionalism. The formation of professionalism is formed on the basis of direct on-the-job training, where residents face clinical situations of various levels of complexity, learning from the experience of senior colleagues, and thereby building their own model of behavior.

Based on the Law on Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, where the autonomy of higher and postgraduate education organizations is enshrined, which gives the right, on the basis of standard rules, orders, etc. The university determines independently the development of the educational programme, assessment, selection and admission of residents, selection/selection of teachers, employment conditions and allocation of resources.

The Regulations on Residency reflect the rights of residents, the implementation of which is facilitated by the department. Freedom of expression of the resident's opinions on their education is usually ensured through anonymous questionnaires, which are carried out centrally, under the supervision of the DQCME. Analysis of feedback on training satisfaction is reported at the departmental meeting.

In the course of interviews with residents, it was established that the freedom of practical and research activities is realized through the work of residents, where under the guidance of a department employee, work is carried out in research work, subsequent analysis and interpretation of data, and then writing an article or thesis.

Feedback is systemic. Thus, in the lobby of the main building, an urn is installed to collect information (proposals, complaints, recommendations) from students addressed to the rector, the chairperson of the Anti-Corruption Committee (<u>https://semeymedicaluniversity.kz/o-nas/obshhestvennyj-sovet-po-protivodejstviyu-korrupczii-v-mediczinskom-universitete-semej/</u>), the SSU. Each month, the contents of the urn are examined and analyzed by a commission. Based on the results of the commission's work, a plan of measures to eliminate complaints is being developed.

# 1.3 Learning outcomes

The final training results presented in the MEP in the specialty "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)" are aimed at forming a qualified specialist in the field of Nephrology, able to work as a nephrologists (adult, pediatric) and provide specialized assistance at the consultative-diagnostic, inpatient-replacement and inpatient levels.

The final results of training in the specialty of residency "**7R01112** Nephrology (adult, children's)" were formed on the basis of the SCES 2020 and the provisions of Tucmos on competencies in the residency of the university partner of the University of Bashkent (Turkey). When formulating the final results of training, the Key Competencies of the SCES were taken as the basis (Appendix – 1.7 EP KC 1-6), Levels of knowledge of clinical competencies (PD, DT, E, P, etc.) and Levels of knowledge of practical skills, manipulations, procedures (1-4). Each of these items is prescribed and applied to nosologies (ICD-10) studied in the residency in priority training of a specialist.

For example, KC-1 - (DT - Able to diagnose and treat patients without the help of a team (team work), DTT - Able to diagnose and treat, working together with a team (team), E - Able to identify an emergency situation and provide emergency care, P - Able to apply preventive measures (primary, secondary, tertiary prevention).

The skills of professional behavior; proper behavior and attitude to patients and their relatives, resident colleagues, teachers, other health care workers (KC-2) are formed on an ongoing basis by conducting conversations, participating in trainings conducted by the staff of the department, a 360-degree questionnaire.

The Code of Ethics for Students, adopted by the NJSC SMU on 15.04.2019, prescribes the principles of the corporate behavior of students, the relationship of students with teachers and among themselves, the relationship of students with doctors, etc. (https://drive.google.com/file/d/17\_CHtm8nfJZOHu7nlPivOsU01qIqt3q/view?usp=sharing). An employee responsible for compliance with ethical standards of behavior in the residency in the specialty "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)" assistant Botabaeva A.S.

Informing the medical community about the established final results of training on the residency programme in the specialty "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)" is carried out by discussing the educational programme at the department, providing the EP to the heads of healthcare organizations and receiving feedback, publishing the EP approved by the Academic Committee on the website of the NJSC SMU (https://semeymedicaluniversity.kz/obuchenie/obrazovatelnye-programmy/)

Since the EP is focused on the expectation of the employer and the needs of the labor market, coordination of the elements of the EP, CED is carried out with employers. Employers, members of professional associations are involved in the review of EP, participation in the discussion of the results at the meetings of the commission on quality assurance of EP.

# 1.4 Participation in the formulation of the mission and final results

All interested parties (university employees, graduates of the residency, health and education authorities, healthcare organizations, employers, professional medical associations, the public) participate in the formation of the mission and final results of training, taking into account their proposals.

The mission and final results of the training of EP "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)" are formulated on the basis of the Standard in the Republic of Kazakhstan. Representatives of the main stakeholders are involved in the formulation of the mission of the EP by discussing the draft mission of the EP at the level of: students, at an enlarged meeting of the Department of Faculty Therapy, the Academic Committee, which includes representatives of employers/representatives of practical health care, students and representatives of various clinical specialties.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 17 standards: full – 17. Standard 1: Implemented Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

# Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME Evidence of compliance:

## 2.1 Postgraduate programme framework

The educational programme in the specialty "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)" was developed in accordance with the State Standard Educational Standard and the Standard Curriculum in the specialty "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)". Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 21, 2020 No.647 KR DSM-12/2020. The order was registered with the Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Kazakhstan on February 27, 2020 No. 20071.

The standard curriculum provides for 2-year training in the residency, with the total minimum amount of hours 4200 (140 credits) and obtaining a qualification - a nephrologists, which also meets the requirements of the State Standard of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No.

647 dated 21.02.2020. Mandatory disciplines/modules reflected in the EP, as well as the university component are optionally included in the educational programme in the specialty in 4 modules.

Also, as a mandatory requirement, the programme includes 2 loans of the "Interim Certification" and 2 loans of the "Final Certification". In total, the educational programme in the specialty "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)" consists of 144 credits.

The list of the most common diseases and conditions to be diagnosed and treated by a nephrologists, given in the Standard Curriculum for the specialty "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)" is fully covered by the list of nosologies and conditions to be mastered by the resident according to the programme "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)", developed on the basis of the study of the requirements of regulatory documents, the TUKMOS programme of the partner's university and the needs of practical health care. The peculiarity of this list is the level of mastery for each state/nosology (E, PD, D, DT, DTT, P), which is the result of strategic cooperation with Bashkent University.

A working curriculum and an educational programme are developed, providing for modular study of disciplines in compliance with the logical sequence of study of disciplines (for the entire period of study on the basis of the standard curricula of the specialty and approved by the chairperson of the academic committee on the basis of the decision of the Academic Council. The work plan contains a complete list of academic subjects grouped into modules with disciplines, indicating the complexity of each academic subject in credits and academic hours. The programme is included in the register of ESUVO of the Ministry of Education and Science (MES RK).

Given the practical orientation of resident training, clinical mentoring occupies an important place, both from the point of view of regulatory documents and from the point of view of the university. Since 2018-2019, the School of Clinical Mentor has been operating in NJSC "SMU". Since 2020-2021, the training of mentors by practical health care at this school is mandatory. Only specialists with extensive clinical experience, having the highest and first qualification category, are involved as mentors for resident nephrologists, which allows transferring skills and experience in a certain field of nephrology to residents. So, among mentors of residents: the director of the Renal center of Semey Medeuov D.M.

Mentors are assigned to a certain resident during the rotation of the resident in this department of the clinical base, which allows you to accompany the practical training of the resident.

The educational programme for residency 7R01112 "Nephrology (adult, children's)" is composed in such a way that the entire list of mandatory disciplines is formed logically and in relation to the future specialty in the future. 6 key competencies in general, reflect the current trends towards the trinity of medical specialists. With the successful completion of the training programme, the resident nephrologists will be able to effectively provide qualified dermatological care to the adult and pediatric population, successfully interact with others, carrying out its activities in compliance with the principles of safety and quality.

#### 2.2 Scientific method

Resident neonatologists simultaneously with clinical work, under the guidance of a teacher, conduct active research activities. In the "Nephrology (adult, children's)" programme, 8 credits have been allocated to strengthen the skills of medical research methodology, which finds practical application in the ability to develop a research protocol, perform it and document the results in the form of an article or protection of a scientific project. The disciplines "Management of scientific research" and "Biostatistics", combined in the module "Research in medicine", are only auxiliary, while the resident will use and improve the acquired skills throughout the residency programme, as well as in his further professional activities.

When studying the disciplines of EP in the sections of diagnosis and treatment of kidney and bladder diseases, clinical protocols and principles of therapy from the standpoint of evidence-based medicine are studied. In the process of training, resident neonatologists carry out tasks to draw up individual programmes for diagnosis, treatment, rehabilitation for various diseases of newborns in accordance with clinical protocols and the principles of evidence-based medicine.

The results of residents' research activities are regularly published in the form of abstracts, articles, and reports at conferences.

Teaching the basics of working with scientific literature, the formation of primary skills of critical assessment of literature, writing scientific articles is carried out in the disciplines of basic higher medical education in the form of various forms of independent work, participation in the SSS, student scientific conferences. The disciplines "Management of scientific research", "Biostatistics" of the training programme impart to residents the principles of scientific approach and evidence-based medicine and form their ability to analytical and critical thinking.

In the course of training in specialized disciplines, resident nephrologists develop the skills of critical evaluation of literature, articles and scientific data within the framework of classes of the "Journal club" type.

Upon completion of the study of the disciplines of EP 7R01112 – "Nephrology (adult, children's)", the resident demonstrates knowledge of evidence-based medicine in relation to his/her specialty, masters the skills of conducting an expert assessment of a scientific article, medical history, standards of examination and treatment based on the principles of evidence-based medicine. The EP provides for training of residents in critical assessment of literature, articles and scientific data through the writing of abstracts, presentations in accordance with the thematic plan of the discipline, essays on current problems of diagnosis and treatment of the most common diseases.

#### 2.3 Content of the residency programme

The core disciplines of the mandatory component of the "Nephrology (adult, children's)" EP are aimed at theoretical and practical training of residents in the field of clinical sciences and preventive medicine, making clinical decisions, communication skills, patient safety issues. Improvement of knowledge and skills in the field of medical ethics, public health, responsibility for one's own health, laid down at the undergraduate level, is carried out directly during practical training with the help of mentors. More complex issues of medical jurisprudence and forensic medicine, knowledge of complementary and alternative medicine develop in the course of discussing various approaches to non-standard situations in the course of discussing clinical cases, analyzing situations, studying the experience of other colleagues.

The development of clinical skills and professional attitude to work is facilitated by the participation of residents in the real activities of the doctor: supervision of patients at the inpatient level, outpatient reception, medical conferences, registration of medical documentation, work in medical information systems (KMIS, AIS), work with regulations, duty, preparation of reports, presentations, formation of a portfolio that provides a visual example of a professional attitude to work in a medical organization and interprofessional communications of specialists of various profiles and levels.

The content of the training programme in the specialty of the residency "Nephrology (adult, children's)" changes depending on the results of the evaluation of the programme, the requirements of the legislation, the needs of practical health care, the study of international experience, including the experience of the partner's university. In 2018, the NJSC SMU was actively working to revise approaches to the formation of final results in the residency, approaches to training and evaluation of residents. In this regard, the correction of the MEP "Nephrology (adult, children's)" was carried out. In 2019, the project of the SCES Residence was published, in 2020, it was approved by the SCES Residence, in connection with which the residency programme was revised. These changes in the legislation coincided with the study of experience at the University of Bashkent. As a result of these processes, the modular programme of residency "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)" in 2021 became the result of these processes.

The duration of the training remains 2 years, 6 core competencies (KC 1-6) remain unchanged. However, according to the new TEP, the composition and scope of disciplines have been changed. The concepts of "level of knowledge of clinical competencies (E, PD, D, DT, DTT, P) and "level of knowledge of practical skills, manipulations, procedures" (I, II, III, IV), "list of nosologies and conditions that must be mastered by the resident", "List of practical skills, manipulations, procedures that must be possessed by the resident" are introduced. The latter is the result of strategic cooperation with Bashkent University, Ankara, Turkey. The approach to training in the residency of the partner university is taken as the basis, however, the final results of training in the residency of NJSC "SMU" are based on the demands of practical health care and the requirements of regulatory documents of the Republic of Kazakhstan. In addition, changes to the EP are made taking into account the needs of employers and practical health care, respectively, employers can make changes that affect the introduction of additional disciplines of the component of choice.

#### 2.4 Programme structure, content and duration

The educational programme consists of 144 credits. The programme structure includes 5 modules. The principle of building a modular educational programme is based on the logic and consistency of studying disciplines. Prerequisites are strictly observed. The principle of rotation and separation of the main disciplines "Nephrology in hospital (adult, paediatric)" and "Outpatient-polyclinic nephrology (adult, paediatric)" allow to consistently deepen the level of mastery of the most important nosological units and medical manipulations.

The ratio of classroom classes and independent work under the guidance of a mentor and independent work of a resident is 10%-75%-15%.

The content of the academic disciplines of the mandatory component is strictly regulated by the State Committee on Standardization and Metrology of 21.02.2020, and the standard curriculum already defines a list of disciplines/modules included in the mandatory component. The educational programme (EP) in the specialty "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)" allows residents to plan and implement an individual, directed learning path during the entire training, preparing for work in the chosen specialty. The number of study hours for two years of study is 4,200, which corresponds to 140 credits, 4 of which are in CC – elective disciplines. The division of disciplines by hours and semesters is carried out by the department of academic work. All academic disciplines and disciplines of the specialty are closely interconnected. The formation of the content of disciplines is structured into logically completed methodological blocks. Interdisciplinary communication can be clearly seen in the syllabuses of academic disciplines, compiled taking into account the development of prerequisites and postrequisites, as well as taking into account the specifics of the specialty.

The list of disciplines of the component by choice is compiled in accordance with the CED, formed and approved annually at the university. In the specialty "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)", in the CED, in addition to the disciplines "Management of scientific research" and "Biostatistics", the disciplines of CC are included - "Functional diagnostics", "Comorbidity and chronic kidney disease". At the same time, during the study of the provided documentation and interviews with focus groups, it was found that 100% of residents study the disciplines of the component of the choice "Research in Medicine".

#### **2.5 Organization of training**

NJSC SMU has adequate representation of staff, trainees and other stakeholders in the planning of the educational programme. For example, the Academic Committee with a subcommittee on residency includes heads of departments, professors, associate professors, teachers of departments that provide the educational process in the relevant specialty of the residency, leading specialists in practical health care, employers, and representatives of the student population.

Residents studying under the programme 7R01112 – "Nephrology (adult, children's)" undergo training at clinical centers that provide training both inpatient and outpatient settings. In the presented clinical databases, planning and implementation of innovations in teaching methods and evaluation of students are provided.

Clinical bases are selected by the department for clinical work, the assessment of the capabilities of a particular base in achieving the final results of training, is carried out by experienced neonatologists from among practical health care and staff of the department, taking into account the requirements of the educational programme. The department, headed by the head of the department, determines the clinical bases where the resident will be able to get access to patients in their profile of the residency educational programme at all levels of medical care. Clinical bases of the Department of Faculty Therapy, which provide training to residents in the specialty "7R01112 Nephrology (adult,

children's)", are nephrological departments in multidisciplinary medical organizations (EH, University Hospital), in the "Kidney Center" Institution, providing primary, specialized, medical care at the outpatient and inpatient levels to patients with nephrological pathology. The university has concluded agreements with the above clinical bases, and these institutions are included by the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan as clinical bases of the University.

Compliance of clinical bases with accreditation requirements is carried out by specialized accreditation agencies and reflected in the relevant documents.

#### 2.6 Relationship between postgraduate medical education and health care

The "Regulations on the Resident Clinical Mentor" are adopted in the NJSC "SMU".

This provision defines the priority goals of the mentor's work as assistance in acquiring, improving the professional theoretical and practical competencies of residents, mastering the norms of medical ethics and deontology, and educating them to be demanding and interested in the results of work in the process of joint clinical activities. Up to 3 residents are assigned to each mentor, if possible, the presence of a resident of the first and second years of study is provided for the purpose of continuity and "mini-mentoring" of the senior over the junior. The principle of rotation is also observed, in which the resident's clinical mentor changes depending on the department or clinical base on which the resident is located. The objectives of mentoring are achieved by providing the resident with sufficient freedom to carry out practical activities on the one hand, demonstrating the role model, ensuring a relevant level of observation, providing appropriate assistance, providing constructive feedback on the other.

In addition to the mentor, in order to implement the training plan and the quality of the EP, residents are assigned a curator who participates in the preparation of the resident and is personally responsible for the implementation of the training plan, carries out measures for personal and psychological support of the resident during the stages of education. The curator is appointed from among the teaching staff of the course, who have the academic degree of doctor, candidate of medical sciences, as well as the highest qualification category. Curators and mentors in the course of daily work give specific recommendations for further improving professional skills, mastering the standards of medical ethics and deontology, improving the general education and cultural level.

The share of employees from practical health care as mentors was selected from among experienced specialists whose activities are related to the direction of the residency programme (having at least 5 years of experience in this professional field).

According to the developed modular educational programmes, practical skills training in medical care under the guidance of supervisors takes place on various clinical bases. The share of practical training in the educational programme provides for 90%, with the direct participation of a clinical mentor.

# *Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Compliant with 30 standards: fully - 27, partially - 3. *Standard 2: Implemented*

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Optimize innovative and active teaching methods (2.1.5).
- 2) To provide residents with the opportunity to choose elective disciplines in the educational programme. The scientific component (management of scientific research; biostatistics) should be defined as a university component (2.4.2).
- 3) In order to effectively use resources and improve the quality of training, provide for the training of residents in other universities or research institutes in certain disciplines (for example, "Transplantology and Immunology", "Clinical Nephromorphology"), including within the framework of academic mobility (2.6.3).

Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS Evidence of compliance: 3.1 Methods of evaluation When analyzing the documentation, the EEC experts established that the methods of evaluation of residents in the university for all specialties of the residency there is a unified policy of evaluation of residents, including in the specialty "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)", the evaluation policy is reflected in the Regulation on Residence, Academic Policy of the University, the educational programme and syllabuses of disciplines. Also, the resident assessment policy is presented in electronic format on the Platonus and Keyps platforms and on the official website of the university.

The university has introduced an integrated assessment system that takes into account both formative assessment (FA) and summary assessment (SA).

Current monitoring is performed by an academic or clinical mentor. Line supervision evaluates the results of training upon completion of disciplines.

The EEC experts confirmed that the criteria for passing exams or other types of assessment, including the procedure for retaking in residency, are reflected in the "Regulations on Residency".

A student of the residency who has completed the training programme and completed the individual curriculum is allowed to the Final Assessment. The final assessment is carried out in accordance with the final results of the training and includes two stages: 1) knowledge assessment (computer testing); 2) skills assessment.

If the results of the assessment of knowledge and skills under the programme are positive, the resident is issued with a residency certificate. Also, this data is the basis for issuing a specialist certificate. This provision is described in the educational programme in the specialty "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)".

According to the Regulation on the Independent Examination, teachers from other universities who have an academic degree, as well as employers – the most experienced specialists from among practitioners of health care who have the highest qualification category and who were not clinical mentors in the process of training residents, are attracted to the SA as members of the examination commission.

Appeal of the results of the assessment of residents is carried out in accordance with the Academic Policy and the Residence Regulations. If the resident disagrees with the assessment of the final assessment, the resident has the right to appeal the assessment, the rules of appeal are described in the Regulation on the conduct of the appeal.

In the specialty "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)", the final certification was not yet available.

To ensure the objectivity and transparency of the evaluation process, the Department of Nephrology and Cosmetology has developed checklists for conducting current, milestone and final control in the discipline (Mini-CEX, OSCE). Also, the department carries out the formation of a portfolio by each resident individually, in which all the achievements of the resident during the period of study in the residency are recorded. The portfolio serves as a basis for forming the characteristics of a resident and obtaining recommendations for further employment. Portfolio evaluation is carried out according to checklists developed by the department employees.

The compliance of control and measuring instruments with teaching methods and the specifics of the curriculum is monitored by a committee of educational programmes (CEP), which includes experienced methodologists and expert testologists.

The EEC experts confirmed that the university has a Student Assessment Committee on an ongoing basis, whose main tasks are examination of exam material, analysis and approval of tests uploaded to the KEYS platform, as well as analysis and approval of the format and number of stations during the practical skills exam.

All tests before the start of testing undergo a review procedure, after evaluating the test results in the keyps programme, the tests are tested for validity and reliability. The procedure of this inspection was demonstrated by the registrar's office during the visit of the ECC members to this subdivision.

The results of students' academic achievements are recorded in the electronic educational journal through the office-recorder system and the AIS Platonus programme, which automatically generates examination sheets, which is confirmed by experts when viewing 3 electronic journals.

### 3.2 Relationship between evaluation and training

During the visit to the university, the EEC members confirmed that the methods of assessing residents are comparable with the methods of teaching and learning and cover the assessment of all the competencies of students both during practical classes and during examinations.

Differentiated assessment methods are used to assess different learning outcomes, so theoretical knowledge is mainly assessed by testing, and practical skills are assessed using assessment sheets for each section of the practical work.

During the conversation with residents in the specialty "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)" it was established that the achievement of the results of training stated in the EP is carried out due to a significant number of thematic patients and a large volume of surgical interventions on 3 specialized clinical bases, as well as constant advice from a clinical mentor or teacher. Residents are provided with the necessary access to both the management of patients and participation in operations, manipulations, all types of medical documentation, participation in consultations and clinical debriefings with colleagues of related specialties, work in a multidisciplinary team.

*The conclusions of the EEC meet the criteria* of 11 standards: 11 in full. *Standard 3: Implemented Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none* 

# Standard 4: STUDENTS Evidence of compliance:

#### 4.1 Admission and Selection Policy

The mission of the educational programme in the specialty "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)" corresponds to the Mission of the NJSC "SMU" and forms the final set of residents in the specialty "Nephrology (adult, children's)".

Admission of resident nephrologists to the NJSC "SMU" is carried out in accordance with the "Standard Rules for Admission to Education in the Organization of Education, Implementing Educational Programmes of Postgraduate Education" and the Regulations on Admission of Students to Higher and Postgraduate Education in the NJSC "SMU" dated September 16, 2021.

Ensuring a balance between the available capacity and opportunities for training and recruitment of residents is achieved by monitoring the availability of EP resources in preparation for the new academic year at NJSC "SMU".

"Open Days" are held at NJSC "SMU" in different areas and levels of training. All information about the events is actively published on the Semey medical university page in Instagram.

Since the beginning of February 2022, meetings with employers for graduates of residency have been organized in NJSC "SMU", which are held with the participation of representatives of city and district hospitals of East Kazakhstan and Pavlodar regions. During the meetings, the issues of personnel shortages, working conditions, measures of social support for young professionals, such as the payment of salaries in employment, are discussed.

The NJSC "SMU" has developed and implemented a standard operating procedure (SOP) "Algorithm for admission of applicants" (Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan 600 dated October 31, 2018) of all levels, which contains a procedure/methodology for the admission of students of all levels of training.

The entrance examinations of resident nephrologists are held in one stage, while assessing cognitive skills, the amount of knowledge of the level of undergraduate and internship programmes: internal diseases, therapy, HE, propaedeutics of childhood diseases, childhood diseases in the context of PMHC and in the hospital.

To date, there have been no applicants for the residency programme in nephrology from other national or international programmes.

The transparency of the procedure for the selection of resident nephrologists, as well as equal conditions for all applicants, is guaranteed by strict compliance by examiners with the Regulations on the independent examination of NJSC "SMU" dated April 22, 2019.

In order to ensure the transparency of the examination procedure, an annual live broadcast is held on Facebook, with the possibility of viewing the video again.

During the conversation with residents, the EEC experts confirmed that applicants who actively participated in scientific circles, conferences, mastered the internship programme, have good practical skills, clinical thinking and are constantly working to develop and improve their competencies (from interviews with residents, teachers, vice-rector for academic activities) have advantages when enrolling in residency in the specialty "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)".

The procedure for appealing against the decisions of the admission commission is regulated by the Regulation on the conduct of an appeal to the NJSC "SMU" dated 29.05.2020. An appeal commission shall be established by the Rector's order for the period of examinations. An application for appeal shall be submitted to the chairperson of the appeal commission by a person entering the residency. The Appeals Commission works with each person individually.

#### 4.2 Number of residents

In NJSC "SMU", the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 606 is observed . (Registered in the Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Kazakhstan on November 1, 2018 No. 17670) and paragraph 8 of Article 52 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 27, 2007 "On Education" (with additional and amended), the number of residents for each specialty per teacher, which is 1:3. The authorized body – the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan – makes adjustments to the figures of admission.

One of the mechanisms for reviewing the number of residents enrolled for training is the annual Employers' Congress held at NJSC "SMU", at which representatives of the university negotiate the placement of targeted grants for residency by organizations.

On the SMU website there is a module "To Employers", which contains information on the expected release of residents of the current year.

Also, the experts confirmed that the university annually creates and works a commission on the distribution of graduates, which includes representatives of the Ministry of Health of Kazakhstan, the DHC of East Kazakhstan region, the Council of Employers, the university. The Dean's Office of the School of Postgraduate Education, departments analyze the employment of graduates and the need for medical personnel.

Starting from 2019, data on students on the basis of a state educational order for monitoring the employment of university graduates and mandatory 3-year training of young specialists are entered into the "SMU" programme "Accounting of Young Specialists" of JSC "Financial Center". The university also annually submits a report on the results of the distribution of young specialists with personalized lists (protocols) to the observatory (working body) for monitoring and analysis.

The policy of recruitment and admission of residents from small groups of peoples, from among practitioners (doctors) from rural areas and special groups of the population (for example, persons with disabilities) complies with the norms and requirements adopted in the Republic of Kazakhstan.

#### **4.3 Resident support and advice**

Safe learning conditions for residents have been created and are being provided at NJSC SMU. To protect the interests of residents, assist them in educational, scientific, and non-curricular activities, the SMU provides various services for the organization of counselling, psychological, social, and medical support for students. During the conversation with residents, it was revealed that the university provides financial support to residents in need of material assistance. Residents in the regions of Ust-Kamenogorsk, Pavlodar, if necessary, are provided with a hostel.

The system of academic counseling of residents in NJSC "SMU" is represented by the School of Postgraduate Education, resident curators, the head of legal and passport and visa work, a

psychologist. Residents have the opportunity to receive legal advice from the head of the legal support department. The resident can get psychological support from a regular teacher-psychologist.

Every year, a plan of educational work of NJSC "SMU" is developed. Thus, for the 2021-2022 academic year, the Plan includes 12 areas, including the implementation of the "Rukhani Zhangyru" programme, legal education, social and psychological support, work with student self-government and student youth clubs, etc. The plan of educational work of the NJSC for 2021-2022 includes such sections as professionally-oriented education, civic and moral education, spiritual and moral education, social and psychological support for students, etc.

All necessary consultations at certain stages of training of residents of nephrologists are organized by the teachers of the department, including those based on the results of monitoring the academic progress of residents, including unforeseen incidents. In this process, curators and mentors are especially actively involved.

Students are provided with accommodation in a student house. Student clubs are also organized at the university.

The University finances the participation of students at all levels in scientific and practical conferences, congresses, symposia (confirmed from a conversation with the vice-rector for research, teachers, residents).

Students also have the opportunity to report problems or corruption anonymously by contacting the director of a medical school or vice-rectors' blog. On the website of the university there are blogs of the rector, vice-rectors.

To form the clinical thinking of residents, clinical reviews of patients are carried out.

In the NJSC "SMU", the teaching staff of the profile department use a variety of ways to disseminate information: the university's website, chat rooms on the WhatsApp network, participation in briefings held by management, open days, job fairs at the university, round tables with heads of medical institutions and organizations, exhibitions of achievements. All information received is brought to the attention of residents.

In the event of a professional crisis associated with the abuse of office or a fundamental disagreement with a mentor, the resident is supported by colleagues from the department, the SPE.

## 4.4 Representation of residents

EEC experts confirmed that residents participate in meetings of collegial bodies of SMU, where they are official members and express their opinions and suggestions for improvement (during the interview it was found out that the resident neonatologist of the second year of study is part of the CEP for higher postgraduate education). A feedback analysis is carried out in the form of a survey of graduates of the residency and employers, on the basis of which the process of policy development and selection of residents in the specialties of the residency is improved.

The participation of residency students in the development of the residency programme is also carried out through the choice of elective disciplines. Residents have the right to make a proposal, to include in the catalogue of new elective disciplines, in their opinion, necessary for study and contributing to the improvement of the educational programme as a whole. Proposals submitted orally or in writing from residents are necessarily taken into account and taken into account.

The department of faculty therapy collects feedback from residents at the stage of mastering the taught discipline (at the end of studying the discipline), as well as on issues related to the conditions of study/work, problem situations.

The participation of students at all levels in the quality of the educational process is regulated by the Academic Policy of the NJSC "SMU" dated August 31, 2021. The composition of the "CEP of Residency" for 2021-2022 academic year includes 3 residents in clinical specialties.

# 4.5 Working conditions

According to the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 03.09.2021 No.612, residents studying under a state educational order are paid a scholarship in the amount of 88494 (eighty-eight thousand four hundred and ninety-four) tenge. The scholarship is awarded to all residents who have received "Excellent" and "Good" grades based on the results of the interim

certification. Residence students returning from academic leave are awarded a scholarship based on the results of the upcoming interim certification. Graduates of the residency are awarded a scholarship based on the results of the final state certification.

When combining work, residents of the 1st year of study at the department receive 15 thousand rubles at 0.25 rates. It was also confirmed that students of the residency have the opportunity to work in their free time for 0.25 (in the second year of study - 0.5) of the rate as a doctor in healthcare organizations, laboratory assistant, trainee teacher of the department. Residents with the corresponding specialist certificate have an opportunity to work part-time.

Nephrology residents have unrestricted access to patients with a nephrological profile, all types of medical equipment and to all departments of nephrology and hemodialysis in Semey (we were convinced during a visit to the University Hospital of the NJSC SMU, "Kidney Center" Institution on May 24, 2022). The department has an office for mastering theoretical knowledge by residents, there is a separate room for changing clothes, for eating, etc.

The Regulations on the residency of NJSC "SMU" dated 01.02.2021. indicate the boundaries of the resident's responsibility, his participation and conditions for the provision of medical services at the clinical base.

In the process of training resident nephrologists, the possibilities of the Youtube information platform are actively used, where there is a university channel on which video lectures are posted for self-study by residents, including in case of forced breaks in preparation, on the occasion of pregnancy (including maternity/paternity leave), illness or quarantine with COVID-19.

The duty of residents on a clinical basis is one of the types of independent work and is aimed at mastering the tasks of training. Shift planning is reflected in the discipline syllabus.

In accordance with the SCES, a cumulative system is adopted in the residence. In this regard, the residency of NJSC "SMU" provides a system for recounting academic hours in disciplines completed by students before enrolling in the residency. In addition, the resident is exempt from duty at the clinical base, provided that he/she has experience in departments of this type. In case of pregnancy, the resident is released from duty at the clinical base at night. Tuition on an individual schedule in the residency is allowed only if there are appropriate medical recommendations. Provided that the resident provides the relevant certificate by the decision of the SPE, he is provided with the opportunity to study according to an individual schedule.

# *Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Compliant with 30 standards: fully - 29, partially - 1. *Standard 4: Implemented*

## Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Involvement of members of the Association of Nephrologists of the Republic of Kazakhstan and organizations providing nephrological assistance to the population in the process of development of the policy of admission and selection of residents (4.1.8).

#### **Standard 5: FACULTY**

#### **Evidence of compliance:**

#### **5.1 Recruitment and Selection Policy**

The NJSC "SMU" has approved the University Development Programme, in accordance with which the personnel policy of the university is implemented.

The Regulation on the personnel policy of the University was approved on 10.03.2018, additions and changes were made to the Regulation on 30.09.2019.

Rules for the selection of teaching staff on a competitive basis "On approval of the Rules for competitive substitution of positions of faculty and researchers of higher educational institutions", Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 23, 2015 No.230 and Order of the Rector of the SMU No.394 dated August 2, 2018 were developed and approved.

The university takes into account the balance between teaching, scientific research of clinical

departments. The developed job descriptions and regulations establish the responsibilities and duties of teachers and clinical mentors. When forming the staff of departments, the ratio of teachers and residents is taken into account, which is sufficient for effective teaching and learning.

Much attention is paid to the availability of candidates with the appropriate education, clinical experience, qualification category in the relevant specialty and discipline profile.

Personnel of the Department of Faculty Therapy 1 Doctor of Medical Sciences, 5 Candidates of Medical Sciences, 1 PhD. NJSC SMU guarantees that residency teachers are practicing specialists in nephrology.

For the motivational purpose, a competition for the title of the best clinical mentor is held every year, participants are given letters of thanks. In 2020, 3 clinical mentors received letters of appreciation on behalf of the Rector of the NJSC SMU.

#### **5.2 Teachers' obligations and development**

Responsibilities between the staff of the department are reflected in the annual work plan of the department. At the beginning of the academic year, the head of the department, at the first meeting of the department, distributes duties to the staff of the department. In the individual work plan (IWP), the teachers of the department plan their activities for the entire academic year. IWP is considered at the meeting of the department and approved by the Dean of the School of Postgraduate Education.

The workload for all types of activities is evenly distributed among teachers, observing the principle of the trinity of education, science and practice. From 2020-2021 academic year, the volume of teaching load in the residency is 650 hours, for head teachers - 600 hours, for the head of the department – 500 hours.

EEC experts also confirmed that all employees of the university are actively involved in the implementation of new educational technologies of teaching and evaluation implemented at the university: Turkish catalog, Caselog, milestones, MCQ in accordance with the ACGME criteria. Employees of the department hold monthly seminars, conferences for doctors of the clinical base. Teachers of the department contribute to the development and improvement of programmes, the definition of educational goals and results. The staff of the department developed the educational programme of the residency in the specialty"7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)" syllabuses in all disciplines of the educational programme, as well as control and measuring tools, including scorecards of the mini-clinical exam and practical skills.

Periodic assessment of teachers is carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the certification of university employees (May 27, 2019).

Evaluation and recognition of worthy academic activities of teachers, supervisors and mentors is carried out through awarding in accordance with the Regulations on awards adopted at the university, awarding employees (for holidays and anniversaries), KPIs and research work (R&D rating), participation in the contests "The best teacher", "The best curator". The University has developed and approved the "Regulations on holding the contest "Best Teacher" of the University dated 30.09.2019.

According to the "Regulations on the clinical mentor of NJSC "SMU", the mentor is appointed from among qualified practitioners of health care, with at least 5 years of experience in the relevant specialty. It is preferable to have a certificate confirming the completion of the cycle of the School of Clinical Mentors. To study the theoretical aspects of mentoring of teaching staff, and clinical mentors can with the help of methodological recommendations "Improvement of clinical training of students, including on the basis of the introduction of mentoring in clinical databases of medical education organizations" (Astana 2016).

According to the developed Regulations on advanced training and retraining of medical and pharmaceutical personnel of NAO "SMU" teaching staff of departments undergo advanced training 1 time in 5 years in order to update and deepen theoretical knowledge, improve practical skills in clinical specialties.

EEC experts confirmed that the motivational tool for teachers and employees is the annual rating of incentives and motivation of employees, which is revised taking into account new requirements and opportunities, is in constant dynamics.

To improve language competencies there is an opportunity to learn English. In order to constantly improve the new model of teaching specialized disciplines, teachers are constantly trained in pedagogical technologies used in the world educational environment. For example, teachers of the department together with residents underwent online training in the basics of statistics in 2021 (St. Petersburg, Institute of Biostatistics). Experts during a visit to the university got acquainted with certificates.

To stimulate and support talented young specialists, a system has been developed for forming a talent pool of managerial staff - the "Hope" talent pool.

Experts of EEC confirmed that teachers of the department together with residents take part in international peer-reviewed journals, participate in international conferences and publish the results of ongoing research.

Calculation of the mentor's workload is 3.5 hours per resident per day. One mentor is relied on by 4 residents, which is prescribed in the "Regulations on the clinical mentor of a NJSC SMU resident". Compliance with this parameter guarantees individual effective interaction between the mentor and the resident, as well as the possibility of high-quality monitoring of academic and professional achievements of residents.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Compliant with 7 standards: fully – 6, partially – 1. *Standard 5: Implemented* 

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Include topics on the development of pedagogical competencies for clinical mentors in the programme of the School of Mentoring (5.2.2);

# Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES

# **Evidence of compliance:**

# **6.1 Logistics and equipment**

The Department of Faculty Therapy of NJSC "SMU" has a sufficient material and technical base for the professional training of residents in the specialty "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)", which is represented by:

1) the basic institution is the University Hospital of NJSC "SMU";

2) Institution "Kidney center", where there are: urological department for 40 beds, nephrological department for 35 beds, department of clinical toxicology for 10 beds, intensive care and resuscitation ward for 3 beds and a day hospital for 12 beds with a hemodialysis room for 13 beds.

Residents are provided with conditions and opportunities for practical training, management of patients at different levels of medical care: outpatient unit, day and night hospital, operating unit, equipped with modern diagnostic and therapeutic equipment.

Library of NJSC "SMU" with a total area of 1362m<sup>2</sup>. For individual and group work, there are 6 separate rooms equipped with multimedia equipment (Regulation on the discussion rooms of NJSC "SMU"). Purchase of necessary literature is carried out taking into account applications and within the framework of a centralized survey of both residents and teachers, doctoral students and master's students

#### 6.2 Clinical Bases

NJSC "SMU", depending on the number of residents and their distribution, selected and approved the bases for the training of residents of nephrologists: the institution "Kidney Center" in Semey, University Hospital in Semey. Residents have access to all diagnostic rooms and laboratories, with a sufficient number of patients of various severity categories, to provide qualified care and develop practical skills using the possibilities of outpatient, inpatient care and night duty.

Practical skills are mastered under the guidance of a clinical mentor, using checklists for their assessment

#### **6.3 Information technology**

The training of resident nephrologists takes place in person, the elements of the distance learning method are used in webinars, some lectures and in participation in conferences.

Unlimited access to the Internet is provided on the territory of the university, its clinical bases and directly in the study rooms of the department, for free use of the necessary web resources and electronic media.

The library offers free access to the following databases: Cochrane.org, the database "Legendary Books" of the publishing house "Urait", Elsevier "ScienceDirect", "Scopus"; CyberLeninka, the Electronic Library of RSh dissertations, Research methods of the Alexandria Library, Web of Science, Scopus.

When training, working on clinical bases, residents have access to the information systems of medical organizations: KMIS, Medelement (through the password of the head of the department or the clinical mentor), filling in medical documentation, appointment sheets, etc., under the control of their clinical mentor.

Teachers of the department contact resident nephrologists of all years of study through the created working chats in WhatsApp, to solve both working and personal (social) issues.

#### **6.4 Clinical Teams**

Preparation of residents for teamwork skills and effective interaction with other health care specialists includes direct work of residents together with employees of various clinical units: work in outpatient and polyclinic and reception departments, supervision of patients at the level of a day hospital, a round-the-clock hospital, participation in advisory examinations of patients of other medical institutions (under the guidance of a clinical mentor), in workshops and scientific and practical conferences. Working in multidisciplinary teams provides residents with sufficient experience in the team, including with specialists from other healthcare areas.

Skills of coordinated work with colleagues are developed during the examination, treatment of patients with kidney pathology. The resident is present during the consultations, fulfills the orders of senior colleagues within his competence. The result of the resident's activity is controlled by the mentor and documented in the resident's portfolio (electronic portfolio at the implementation stage). The interaction of the resident nephrologists with other team members is estimated to be "360 degrees".

Academic mobility of residents in remote format is carried out with the Ryazan State Municipal University named after academician I.P. Pavlov.

#### 6.5 Medical Research and Advances

As a result of the study of the submitted documentation, it was established that university residents necessarily study the disciplines "Management of scientific research" (4 credits) and "Biostatistics" (4 credits) in the 1st and 2nd years of residency, included in the Catalog of elective disciplines. Thus, all resident nephrologists are involved in the research work of the department. Resident nephrologists can independently carry out some stages of clinical research: questionnaires of patients, conducting some diagnostic manipulations, etc.

The study of clinical cases of patients, medical records, literature data, work in the library enable resident neonatologists to analyze, describe and publish their data in national and international scientific journals. The result of 2 years of study in the residency in the specialty "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)" is the publication of scientific work, which is necessarily taken into account when entering the next stage of postgraduate education - in doctoral studies.

# 6.6 Education expertise

The examination of the quality of the educational programme is systematic and carried out in stages. The educational programme of the residency in the specialty "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)" is based on the State Standard of Education and Science of 2020 and approaches to the training of the university partner of the University "Bashkent" (Turkey) in the specialties

"Nephrology". After agreement with the Deputy Chairperson of the Board of NJSC "SMU" for academic work, the programme is entered in the Register of EP of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, where after an independent external examination, the programme is applied in the educational process.

The Strategy for ensuring the quality of the educational process has been developed and implemented in NJSC "SMU". Monitoring of the implementation of the EP of the residency programmes is carried out on the basis of the principle of collective solidarity of all interested parties: the specialized department, SPE, the Academic Committee, residents, representatives of practical health care, potential employers and the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Feedback from residents is carried out through the SPE, DQCME to determine the degree of satisfaction with the content of the educational programme and the organization of the educational process, which are carried out in the form of questionnaires, focus groups, constant monitoring of appeals to the blog of the dean's office, Deputy Chairperson of the Board for Academic Work, Deputy Chairperson of the Board for Scientific and Clinical Work, Chairperson of the Board. In addition, the school of postgraduate education collects feedback from graduates of residency and their employers.

The Academic Committee annually organizes events to improve the educational programmes of the residency: forms working groups, on expert evaluation, working curricula, methods of training and evaluation in the residency, development and monitoring of the resident portfolio, examination of the catalog of elective disciplines, planning of measures to improve the content and the process of implementing the educational programme. Profiling departments update the content of curricula in accordance with the development of medical science and education. This process should be documented in the case of the introduction of innovative teaching methods in the educational process, for subsequent monitoring during implementation at specialized departments.

The faculty will study the results of the implementation of the updated educational programme on the basis of an analysis of the success of its graduates according to an independent examination and feedback from employers.

#### **6.7 Training in other institutions**

The mechanism for the implementation of the academic mobility programme for teaching staff and residents was developed and approved in the "Regulation on academic mobility of students, teachers and employees" (March 18, 2019), including the Regulation "On the organization of academic mobility within the framework of the Kazakhstan credit recounting system", to facilitate the procedure for academic recognition of diplomas and qualifications, ensuring transparency of educational programmes and curricula.

The search for a partner university, the development of an academic mobility programme, organizational issues of training and accommodation is carried out by an academic mobility specialist together with the supervising department and the SPE.

The coordinator for academic mobility organizes the work of the commission for conducting a competition among students and faculty.

# *Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with* 21 standards: fully -20, partially - 1. *Standard 6: Implemented*

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Provide training for residents in a number of disciplines at alternative clinical bases, for example, in other universities or research institutes (6.2.1).

## Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION Evidence of compliance:

#### 7.1 Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms

Having analyzed the educational programme in the discipline R701112 "Nephrology (adult, children's)", the experts of the EEC found that at the university, the monitoring and evaluation of the implementation of the educational programme of the residency is carried out on the basis of the

collective solidarity of all stakeholders and employees of the university. At the stage of planning the educational process in the specialty of residency, the responsibility for checking the working curricula for compliance with the requirements of state educational standards, drawing up a schedule is assigned to the departments. Responsibility for the selection of the composition of teachers meeting the qualification requirements, the profile of the specialty is assigned to the Human Resources Management Department. Checking the quality of the EMCD and monitoring the educational and methodological documentation of the departments of residency is carried out by the CEP.

The training and clinical center is a structural unit responsible for the provision and maintenance of simulators necessary to develop the practical skills of residents and at the stage of final certification.

The Registrar's office registers and stores examination records, which are documentary evidence of the recognition of academic achievements of residents.

The peculiarity of the analysis of the formation of the competence of residents of NJSC "SMU" is a comprehensive assessment of the resident by the teacher through formal, summary control over the discipline, by the mentor - through portfolio management, control over the mastery of practical skills and research competencies, by the PGE school through the analysis of reports provided by residents, by practical health care (potential employer) through participation in an independent examination of residents.

The competencies of the students of the residency of the "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)" of the NJSC "SMU" are assessed through current, midterm, intermediate control; control over the mastery of practical skills and research competencies; through the analysis of reports, individual plans for the development of residents (Assessment 3600). The 3600 Evaluation questionnaire reflects the professionalism, interpersonal and communication skills of the resident as a doctor.

The applied system of assessment of knowledge, skills, abilities and competencies in the specialty of residency "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)" corresponds to the SCES of the RoK. **7.2 Feedback from teachers and residents** 

In order to ensure the transparency of the process and evaluation results for management and stakeholders, the process of collecting feedback from students is automated and carried out in keyps, in order to avoid correction or distortion of feedback data. In addition, the results of the feedback are published on the university's website in the "Feedback" section in order for all interested parties to have an opportunity to read it. The School of Postgraduate Education collects feedback from residents to determine the level of satisfaction of residents with the content of the educational programme, the organization of the educational process in the form of questionnaires, focus groups, monitoring of appeals to the school's blog. Schools have a feedback box where residents can incognito leave their suggestions, wishes and complaints. An important role in the evaluation of the educational programme is played by monitoring the achievement by residents of the final learning goals. Therefore, the school collects feedback from residency graduates and their employers.

The basic departments collect feedback from residents, representatives of practical health care, teachers of related disciplines on the assessment and optimization of the content of the educational programme in the form of reviews, focus groups, questionnaires, etc.

The results of the study of feedback from stakeholders are voiced at the meetings of the departments, the Academic Council and the CEP.

Feedback analysis is provided for discussion at meetings of departments, the Committee of educational programmes and the Academic Council, which include teachers, residents and members of the Employers' Council. During these meetings, plans are being developed to further improve the quality of graduate training. In 2022, feedback was received from employers on the educational programme "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)".

The university has identified and used feedback mechanisms, as well as tools for training a medical specialist through continuous communication with medical practice and the health care system. As such tools, feedback from employers on the level of training of graduates, carried out in the form of a questionnaire, is used.

#### 7.3 Results of Residents and Graduates

An important role in the evaluation of the educational programme is played by the results of the final certification of residents carried out at the testing stage by the National Center for Independent Examination, as well as the results of certification examinations conducted by the Committee for Control of Medical and Pharmaceutical Activities of the Ministry of Health and Social Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The final state certification of residents in the 2020-2021 academic year was carried out in accordance with the standard of the State Standard of the Residence and was carried out in the following stages: determination of the level of theoretical training in the disciplines in the form of testing; certification of practical skills with a standardized patient. The results of these examinations are discussed annually at the meeting of the Academic Council.

During the reporting period, there was no final certification in the specialty of "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)".

#### 7.4 Stakeholder Engagement

The University provides various mechanisms for involving stakeholders in the monitoring and evaluation of the educational programme.

At NJSC SMU, due representation of stakeholders in the assessment of the processes and final results of resident training programmes is observed. For example, the CEP of postgraduate and additional education includes heads of department, professors, associate professors, teachers of departments that provide the educational process in the relevant speciality, leading specialists in practical health care, employers, and representatives of the student population. The composition of the EMC, the CEP is approved by the Rector of the University.

Representatives of practical health care, employers are obligatory members of the examination commission of the state certification of graduates.

Stakeholders' access to the results of the evaluation of educational programmes is ensured by publishing relevant analytical references and feedback analysis on the website of NJSC "SMU". In addition, the discussion of the feedback results is carried out at the meetings of the Academic Council of the SPGE, the CEP of the PGE, which includes representatives of all interested parties, as well as at the meetings of the department.

#### 7.5 Procedure for Approval of Educational Programmes

The educational programme in the specialty R701112 "Nephrology (adult, children's)" was approved at a meeting of the chair and subcommittee of the residency of the academic committee (AC) through the voting procedure. After all the necessary conditions are met, it is entered in the register of educational programmes.

The School of Postgraduate Education collects feedback from residents to determine the level of satisfaction of residents with the content of the educational programme, the organization of the educational process in the form of questionnaires, focus groups, monitoring of appeals to the school's blog.

An important role in the evaluation of the educational programme is played by monitoring the achievement by residents of the final learning goals. Therefore, the school collects feedback from residency graduates and their employers.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with15 standards: fully – 15. Standard 7: Implemented Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION Evidence of compliance:

# 8.1 Management

The guarantee of the implementation of the "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)" educational programme is its strict compliance with the requirements of regulatory rules regarding the admission of residents (selection criteria and number), the learning process, assessment of knowledge

and skills, established learning outcomes, programme management, which are regulated in the Republic of Kazakhstan by regulatory legal acts of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Internal documents of NJSC "SMU" are developed on the basis of republican regulations.

Thus, the Regulation on the admission of students to higher and postgraduate education in the Non-Profit Joint Stock Company "Medical University Semey" dated September 16, 2021 was developed in accordance with the "Standard Rules for Admission to Education Organizations Implementing Educational Programmes of Higher Education", approved by Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 600 dated October 31, 2018.

The process of training, assessment of knowledge and skills is regulated by the Regulations on the residency of NJSC "SMU" dated 01.02.2021.

#### 8.2 Academic Leadership

Control and monitoring of planning, organization of coordination, provision of the educational process, introduction of innovations in the educational process, educational and methodological activities of departments is carried out by the Department of Academic Work (DAW), which works under the direct supervision of the Deputy Chairperson of the Board for Academic Work.

The work on the organization and monitoring of the postgraduate level of study at the university is carried out by the School of Postgraduate Education (SPE), which coordinates the organization of the educational process: the schedule, the appointment of a curator, the choice of a clinical base, the formation of an individual work curriculum, enrollment in elective disciplines, sending to a conference, participation in competitions, solving issues of academic mobility of employment.

A great deal of organizational and methodological work is carried out by the Committee of Educational Programmes of Postgraduate Education (PGE), where the compliance of teaching methods with control methods and final learning outcomes formed in Syllabuses is checked and approved. Methods of final control: OSCE and OSPE.

The regulatory role of the collegial bodies - the Academic Committee, the Academic Council is also important and relevant. Thus, the results of the final certification of graduates are regularly discussed at the Academic Council of NJSC "SMU". The chairpersons of the State Attestation Commissions conduct a report with an analysis of the average score, make recommendations for improving both the educational process as a whole and the final attestation procedure itself.

The main educational, educational-methodical, scientific-clinical load on the undergraduate training of students – residents is implemented by specialized departments

## 8.3 Training budget and resource allocation

The main sources of formation of financial resources of the educational process at the university are: funds of the republican budget; funds under contracts of study on a reimbursable basis; funds from the provision of educational and other paid services.

The solution of key issues of the distribution of financial resources of the university (university budget) is carried out in three stages: at the first stage at the meeting of the Economic Council, at the second – the Scientific Council of the NJSC "SMU", at the third Board of Directors, which ensures the collegiality, involvement of all categories of employees of the NJSC "SMU", as well as the avoidance of conflict of interest.

Information on the results of financial and economic activities of NJSC "SMU" and the implementation of the cost estimates are heard annually on the Academic Council of the university, which is broadcast online on the page of NJSC "SMU" on Facebook.

The educational programme of the residency in the specialty" 7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)" is financed from the republican budget. In addition, there is a possibility of training at the expense of own funds, targeted training at the expense of medical organizations, and a grant from regional akims.

The Department of Economics and Finance clearly regulates all financial revenues for the introduction and implementation of the training programme in the specialty "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)". Educational resources are distributed in accordance with needs.

#### 8.4 Administration and Management

The academic leader of effective management and allocation of resources for the educational programmes implemented at the university is the Deputy Chairperson of the Board for Academic Work.

At the level of specialized and general education departments – heads of departments, the activities of which are regulated by the Job Descriptions.

The overall management of the university is carried out through collegiate bodies, which include representatives of the SSG, employers, and other stakeholders, which ensures their participation in all areas of the university's activities.

The University has developed and successfully implemented, and repeatedly certified the quality management system by the authorized certification bodies of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The Quality Manual, documented procedures, internal instructions, regulations, SOPs have been developed. The Academic Council annually approves the University Quality Policy and the University Quality Objectives developed with the participation of stakeholders, on the basis of which each department sets its annual goals. The Quality Policy and Objectives are available for review on the website of the university in the section "Quality Management System".

# **8.5 Requirements and regulations**

The activities of the EP management in the specialty "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)" are based on the strict fulfillment of the requirements established by the regulatory documents of the Ministry of Education and Science and the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan in terms of the educational process and the qualification characteristics of a nephrologist.

The university's governance system involves all stakeholders, including the health sector, and reflects the responsibility of academic leadership. Representatives of practical health care, employers are obligatory members of the examination commission of the state certification of graduates. Doctors with extensive work experience are part-time employees in the departments of senior courses, which also makes it possible for other stakeholders to participate in the implementation of the university curriculum. Chief physicians of clinical bases are officially included in the composition of the SC, AC, CEP.

The process of high-quality implementation of the educational programme "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)" is facilitated by the constructive dialogue established by the management of the Department of Faculty Therapy with the management of clinical bases identified by NJSC "SMU" as training bases for nephrologists.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 15 standards: fully – 15. Standard 8: Implemented Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

# Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL

# **Evidence of compliance:**

Taking into account the tendency of "trinity" regarding medical specialists, the university made a collegial decision to include in the educational programme of the residency a component of choice on the topic "Research in Medicine". The mandatory requirement for mastering this elective is that the resident performs his own research with the subsequent registration of the research result in the form of an article and/or a report at the conference. Pedagogical competencies are developed by actively involving residents in the process of formal and non-formal education of undergraduate, internship and junior year students.

The responsibility for ensuring the quality of medical education rests with the relevant department, the DQCME, the department of the clinic, the SPE, the Deputy Chairperson of the Board for the AW and the SCR, the Chairperson of the Board – the Rector.

The "Strategy for ensuring the quality of the educational process in the NJSC of the SMU" dated 23.11.2020 is being implemented.

To regulate the mechanisms for assessing and monitoring the educational process, there are relevant internal regulatory documents.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 4 standards: fully - 4. Standard 9: Implemented Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none

# 6. Recommendations for improving the educational programme "Nephrology (adult, children's)"

- 1) Optimize innovative and active teaching methods (2.1.5).
- 2) To provide residents with the opportunity to choose elective disciplines in the educational programme. The scientific component (management of scientific research; biostatistics) should be defined as a university component (2.4.2).
- 3) In order to effectively use resources and improve the quality of training, provide for the training of residents in other universities or research institutes in certain disciplines (for example, "Transplantology and Immunology", "Clinical Nephromorphology"), including within the framework of academic mobility (2.6.3).
- 4) Involvement of members of the Association of Nephrologists of the Republic of Kazakhstan and organizations providing nephrological assistance to the population in the process of development of the policy of admission and selection of residents (4.1.8).
- 5) Include topics on the development of pedagogical competencies for clinical mentors in the programme of the School of Mentoring (5.2.2);
- 6) Provide training for residents in a number of disciplines at alternative clinical bases, for example, in other universities or research institutes (6.2.1).

## 7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

Members of the EEC came to a unanimous opinion to recommend to the Accreditation Council to accredit the educational programme "7R01112 Nephrology (adult, children's)" of the Non-Profit Joint Stock Company "SEMEY MEDICAL UNIVERSITY", corresponding to the Standards of accreditation of educational programmes of the residency of the medical organization of education for a period of 5 years

Chairperson of the External Expert Commission Zhanalina Bakhyt Sekerbekovna Foreign expert **Ripp Evgeny Germanovich** National Academic Expert Zhumalina Akmaral Kanashevna National Academic Expert Turgunov Yermek Meiramovich National Academic Expert Dzhandaev Serik Zhakenovich National Academic Expert Urazova Saltanat Nurgozhayevna National Academic Expert Ligai Zoya Nikolaevna National Academic Expert Chingaeva Gulnar Nurtasovna, National Academic Expert Bozhbanbayeva Nishangul Seitbekovna National Academic Expert Beisembayev Askhat Ulzhan Tursunkulovna National Academic Expert Doshakanova Assel Baidauletovna Expert – employer representative Tuleutaeva Gulnara Esenzhanovna Expert – resident representative Amina Timurovna Izmaeva

# Attachment 1.

	(generalization)	70	Estimation		
Standard	Evaluation Criteria	Number of standards	Fully compliant	Partially compliant	Not compliant
1	MISSION AND END OUTCOMES	17	17		
2	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME	30	27	3	
3	ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS	11	11		
4	STUDENTS	30	29	1	
5	FACULTY	7	6	1	
6	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	21	20	1	
7	PROGRAMME EVALUATION	15	15		
8	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	15	15		
9	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	4	4		
	Subtotal:	150	144	6	
				150	

# Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme (generalization)

# Attachment 2.

N⁰	Document Title	Date of approval	
1.	Mission (Revised)	24.02.2022	
		Scientific Council	
2.	Residency Regulation (Revised)	12.05.2022	
	Clinical Instructor Statement (Revised)	12.05.2022	
4.	Regulations on the organization of the NJSC SMU summer /	30.11.2020	
	winter school		
5.	Regulations on student self-government	1.11.2021	
6.	Regulations on Academic Mobility of Students, Teachers and	10.09.2021	
	Employees		
7.	Code of Conduct	21.11.2019	
8.	Regulations on the competition for the positions of teaching	24.09.2019	
	staff		
10	Regulation on personnel policy	30.09.2019	
10.	Regulations on the personnel reserve Hope	24.05.2019	
	Regulation on advanced training and retraining of medical and	June 4, 2019	
10	pharmaceutical personnel	0.05.2010	
	Regulation on staff development and development	8.05.2019	
13.	Regulations on professional development and development of	25.11.2020	
1.4	AMP employees	Max 2, 2010	
	Library Regulations Regulation on the activities of SSS	May 2, 2019 14.05.2021	
17.	Regulations on the journal "Science and Health Care"	8.05.2019 18.11.2019	
17.	Regulations on the Student Appraisal Committee Regulations on the organization and holding of scientific-	April 5, 2019	
10.	practical and intra-university conferences of students in NJSC	April 5, 2019	
	"SMU"		
19.	Regulations on scientific schools	13.05.2019	
20.	Regulation on the rating of research activities of the NJSC	15.09.2021	
	"SMU"		
21.	Regulation on the formation of NJSC SMU applications	1.10.2021	
22.	Regulation on the Interdepartmental Control of NJSC "SMU"	11.11.2019	
23.	Regulation on coordinators of courses/specialties responsible for	30.09.2020	
	integrated and non-integrated disciplines		
24.	Regulations on the Assessment of Academic Progress of NJSC	18.11.2019	
	"SMU" Students		
25.	Regulation on the Anti-Corruption Committee	17.02.2020	
26.	Regulations on the Academic Committee	18.11.2019	
27.	Regulations on the dissertation council of the NJSC "SMU"	27.05.2019	
28.	Regulation on the Clinical Committee of the NJSC "SMU"	19.11.2020	
29.	Regulations on the Committee for Educational Programmes	11.11.2019	
30.	Regulations on the Academic Council	23.05.2019	
31.	Statement on the development and monitoring of the annual	25.02.2020	
	development plan for the SMU (Action plan) and the work plan		
	and departmental work plan (Process plan)		

# List of documents studied as part of the external expert evaluation

32.	Regulation on the procedure for the participation of external stakeholders in the implementation of the quality assurance policy in the NJSC SMU	26.11.2020
33.	Institutional accreditation certificate	10.06.2019
34.	Academic Policy	31.08.2021
35.	Regulation on the procedure for the transfer and restoration, expulsion of students	18.06.2021
36.	Academic Integrity Policy	11.11.2019
37.	Regulations on dormitories	May 2, 2019
38.	Anti-Corruption Standard New Revision	29.03.2022
39.	Code of Ethics for Students	April 1, 2019